

MUSEUMS ASSOCIATION RESPONSE TO THE DCMS MUSEUMS REVIEW 2016

ABOUT THE MUSEUMS ASSOCIATION

1. The Museums Association (MA) is a membership organisation representing and supporting museums and people who work for them, throughout the UK. Our membership of over 8000 includes all types of museums, from small volunteer-run locals to large nationals and people working in all types of roles from directors to trainees. Founded 125 years ago, in 1889, the MA was the world's first professional body for museums. We lead thinking in UK museums with initiatives such as *Collections for the Future, Museums 2020* and, most recently, *Museums Change Lives*. We receive no regular public funding, and we do not wish to do so.

SECTION 1: A FRAMEWORK FOR THE FUTURE OF MUSEUMS

- 2. Museums are public-facing institutions which deliver a range of important public benefits. They preserve, protect and promote the nation's collective memory, knowledge and history. They engage and work in partnership with the public to share stories, preserve and present collections of objects, works and specimens, bringing important cultural, educational, social and scientific ideas to life. They play a role in enhancing health and wellbeing; creating better places to live, work and visit; and inspiring new ideas. The potential for museums to contribute across a range of public policy agendas culture, science, education, tourism, immigration, hate crime, international trade and diplomacy, health and social services is substantial.
- 3. Museums are often loved and trusted public institutions. They continue to be highly popular with the public: 52.5% of English adults report visiting a museum in the past year, with increases in attendance recorded across all regions over the past decade¹. However, there are still marked variations in regional, ethnic and socio-economic participation in museums, and we believe that the sector needs to become more accessible and play a more active part in many people's lives, including making a greater effort to reduce inequality and to improve wellbeing throughout society.
- 4. Museums are key institutions in local, regional and national life. The MA believes that everyone in the UK should have access to a high quality museum in their area. However, radical changes to public funding are putting the survival of some museums at risk and threaten to leave the public in some areas with little access to museums.
- 5. Given the above, we believe that any government strategy for the future of museums in England should meet the following key tests:

-



- Public benefit does government strategy recognise and support the public benefits that museums deliver?
- Accessibility and impact does government strategy seek to work across departments to increase the accessibility and relevance of museums to audiences and potential audiences?
- Geographic diversity does government strategy ensure investment and support for high quality museum provision throughout England at local, regional and national levels?

The recommendations that we make throughout this document are designed to help achieve these goals.

SECTION 2: MUSEUM FUNDING

Overview

6. The museums sector in England consists of 1312 museums in Arts Council England's Accreditation Scheme, and a further several hundred non-accredited museums. The sector is highly diverse – it includes national, local authority, independent, military and university museums. The Accreditation scheme reported in February 2016 that the breakdown of governance of museums within the scheme was as follows²:

Type of Museum	Number
Local Authority	372
Independent	631
Independent: National Trust	125
Military	51
University	55
National	44
English Heritage	34
TOTAL	1312

- 7. Museums have different funding arrangements based on their governance and other specific agreements. However, almost all museums are supported by a mixed model of funding that includes public funding, lottery funding, philanthropy and donations, and earned income. All museums face the same challenges of high fixed overheads inherent in the core business of caring for collections and buildings and ensuring public access this requires long-term planning and consistent levels of basic funding.
- 8. Public investment in museums takes two broad forms: direct revenue investment in museums and their core business; and project support, capital investment, tax relief and investment in local infrastructure. Museums need the former to take advantage

² http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/sites/default/files/download-file/Statistical Report 2016-02-25 Accreditation.pdf



of the latter, and some independent museums rely on the latter to maintain their viability.

Civic Museums in Crisis

- 9. Many civic museums those museums directly managed by or principally funded by local authorities – are under severe financial pressure. The reduction in cultural funding by local authorities is the main driver for this. DCLG figures show a decrease in spending on culture by local authorities in England of £236m since 2010³. As nonstatutory services, museums can be seen as 'expendable' or an easy target for budget cuts, particularly when judged against local authorities' statutory responsibilities4.
- 10. Museum closures have been the most public expression of the crisis facing civic museums. In total, at least 48 museums have closed in the UK since 2010⁵. The majority of these have been caused by local authority funding cuts. The MA expects the number of museums closures to grow in the next few years. More museums than ever before are under threat of closure including those in: Kirklees, Lancaster, Dudley, Teesside and Walsall.
- 11. Less prosperous areas are feeling the brunt of the crisis in museum funding. The MA is concerned that further cuts to public finances and the move to 100% Business Rate Retention will leave local authorities in less wealthy areas of England unable to fund non-statutory services such as museums.
- 12. Recommendation: DCMS should make the case across government for sustained local authority and Arts Council England funding for museums throughout England.
- 13. Recommendation: Museums facing the sudden withdrawal of local authority support are sometimes forced to close before any alternatives, including alternative management, are considered. Arts Council England has an existing system of 'financial intervention' for other types of arts venues (such as Hull Truck Theatre Company⁶), but has not used these funds for museums up to this point. We believe that ACE should make financial intervention funding available for civic museums facing closure in circumstances where there is a viable alternative plan.
- 14. Recommendation: Lottery funding from the ACE-administered Arts Lottery has been shown to be spent disproportionately in London and in wealthier areas of the UK⁷. We believe that lottery spending should bear a closer relation to the regions where lottery funding is raised, and that museums in areas of low lottery funding take-up should be supported to prepare bids.

http://www.nlgn.org.uk/public/wp-content/uploads/Funding-Arts-and-Culture.pdf

⁴ http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/sites/default/files/download-

file/Research to understand the resilience and challenges to this of Local Authority museums.pdf

http://www.museumsassociation.org/campaigns/funding-cuts/19062013-museum-closures-map

⁶ http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/entertainment-arts-30794328

⁷ http://www.gpsculture.co.uk/place.php



15. Recommendation: Lottery funding from HLF should be directed increasingly away from large construction projects and towards making the most of the museums and galleries that we already have. In particular, HLF funding should support project-based work such as gallery refurbishments, and should include staff costs for key project posts in areas such as programming, and learning and engagement.

Governance, Devolution and Regional Co-operation

- 16. The financial pressures on civic museums mean that many are facing a range of short- and long-term challenges. These include: reduced opening hours; loss of schools engagement and other social outreach work; loss of professional expertise; replacement of professional posts with unpaid posts; decreasing diversity of the museum workforce and museum audiences; sale of items from museum collections; and lack of funds for upkeep of museum buildings⁸.
- 17. In response to these challenges, there is a growing trend to contract out management of the museum (and employment of staff) to a specially created charitable company or trust, with a substantial portion of its funding being provided by the local authority, but increasing amounts raised from other sources; examples include Luton Museums and Birmingham Museums. This approach has been successful in some cases, and not as successful in others. Several local authorities have examined the charitable trust option and have chosen not to proceed with it. The most successful examples of local authority museums becoming charitable trusts have involved local authorities maintaining a close relationship with and financial support for museums.
- 18. Recommendation: The decision to move museum governance to the charitable trust model should continue to be taken on a case-by-case basis by the existing governing body.
- 19. Some museums have sought to become more resilient to public funding cuts by acting together and sharing the costs of some functions within a region or area. The Humber Museums Partnership, Tyne & Wear Archives and Museums and the Manchester Museums Partnership have been set up to share the cost of some functions, such as administration and marketing as well as some specific museum roles such as conservation and curation. Such partnerships can help to forge new cultural links and achieve region-wide economies of scale that can drive more ambitious projects. These partnerships can exist formally or informally, but all have required the political will of local authorities to maximize their potential. It should also be noted that the 2015 Welsh Museums Review set out proposals for regional hubs and therefore the realizing of economies of scale, although these plans have not yet been taken forward.

_

http://www.museumsassociation.org/campaigns/funding-cuts/cuts-survey



20. Recommendation: Local Authorities should be supported in establishing local partnership arrangements where appropriate. Additional funding from ACE could help to develop this type of arrangement further. It could also feature in some devolution deals.

Generating Income and Entrance Charges

- 21. Recognising the long-term changes in public finances, many museums have taken steps to increase their financial sustainability. Museums have invested in projects to help generate their own income, with valuable support from ACE and HLF, including:
 - Seeking philanthropic support, such as the successful Catalyst Project funded endowment for the Bowes Museum⁹; and the Art Fund supported Going Public initiative at Sheffield Museums¹⁰;
 - Public fundraising, such as the notably successful Radical Heroes campaign by People's History Museum in Manchester¹¹;
 - Improving commercial income; this can include improvements to traditional revenue streams such as the shop and café, but increasingly comprises the development of new revenue streams. For example, the Black Country Living Museum has become a major filming destination¹²; Bristol Museum is among many museums to have developed competitive online shops¹³; some museums provide art and museum advisory services; and there are many more innovative examples¹⁴.
 - Establishing partnerships with local third sector organisations.
- 22. Such initiatives can help to reduce museums' reliance on public funds, but cannot replace public funding for the vast majority of civic museums. In particular, the sector has discovered that philanthropic income is harder to generate outside of London, and tends to be focused on paying for specific acquisitions or projects, rather than running costs.
- 23. Recommendation: Many museums have benefited from seed-funding from the public sector to drive commercial projects or to attract additional investment. Seed-funding for revenue-generating projects should continue to be made available through both ACE and HLF, and further consideration should be given to continuation of the Catalyst Fund which has supported museums to generate their own income.

⁹ http://www.thebowesmuseum.org.uk/aboutus/museumachieves%C2%A31mcataylsttarget.aspx

http://www.museums-sheffield.org.uk/about/going-public

http://www.phm.org.uk/support-us/sponsors/100-radical-heroes/

http://advisor.museumsandheritage.com/features/black-country-living-museum-action-how-filming-can-raise-the-coffers-and-profile-of-a-museum/

¹³ http://shop.bristolmuseums.org.uk/

http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/blog/commercial-curator



- 24. It is also worth noting that a small number of civic museums have recently introduced entry charges, including York Art Gallery and Brighton Museums. In both cases, the introduction of charging has had a worse-than-predicted impact on visitor numbers¹⁵ and has made the museums less accessible.
- 25. Recommendation: The MA recognises the mixed nature of the museums sector in the UK, in which some museums charge, while many are free. However, we believe that free museum access should be maintained where possible given the wide range of social and public benefits that museums deliver. Furthermore, the introduction of charging would not resolve the current financial situation that many museums face. For example, Derby Museums Trust estimates that the introduction of an entry charge would bring in a maximum of 10% of their current annual costs, while having a damaging impact in diversity of audiences and overall attendance.

Museum Freedoms

- 26. The government introduced a series of 'freedoms' for the national museums in 2013¹⁶ to allow the national museums more freedom to take decisions that have helped to put national museums in a strong position for the future. These can be summarized as:
 - Power to borrow up to £40 million per year from Government, and authorisation to invest non-grant income.
 - Powers to manage their money allowing museums access to their reserves, so that they can save up their major donations and spend them over time, rather than having to spend funds in that financial year.
 - Removal of the 1% limit on pay awards for all positions so that museums ensure they can attract the best expertise (like academies, free schools and foundation hospitals).
 - A special exemption from Government procurement policy, giving museums freedom to opt in or out of central procurement on a case by case basis so that they can make their own choices about key contracts.
- 27. Recommendation: The introduction of a similar set of freedoms for local authority museums would help them to innovate and secure new sources of income while maintaining and developing their role as public institutions. In particular, the following freedoms could reduce costs and provide new opportunities:

¹⁵



- Powers to manage their money allowing museums access to their reserves, so that they can save up their major donations and spend them over time, rather than having to spend funds in that financial year.
- Exemptions from local authority procurement policy, giving museums freedom to opt in or out of central procurement on a case by case basis so that they can make their own choices about key contracts. This is particularly important in specialist procurement, but could also apply to catering and other contracts.
- Freedom over websites and communications. Many local authority museums across the UK still have poor websites and digital communications¹⁷. In most cases, this is the result of the perceived high-cost of website design, inflexible procurement rules, and a risk-averse communications strategy within the organisation. Some local authorities limit the ability of museums to take control of their own communications channels, such as Twitter and Facebook, with a clear detrimental impact on their ability to communicate with audiences.

Business Rates

- 28. The application of Business Rates to museums is complex. Museums that are constituted as charities are concerned about the changes being made to Non-Domestic Rate Relief. At present, UK charities benefit from 80% mandatory rate relief on their properties and 75% benefit from additional discretionary relief. Some museums already report this relief being cut, and many fear further costs as business rates become a more important source of local authority income under the local authority funding settlement. Many museums are also concerned that the banding for their rates has been wrongly applied 18.
- 29. Recommendation: DCMS should engage with HMT, DCLG and the LGA to provide guidance that protects the existing rate-reliefs for museums constituted as charities, and should amend the necessary Statutory Instrument to ensure that museums' properties are valued appropriately as Educational Hereditaments.

SECTION 3: MUSEUM ACTIVITY

Maintaining a Social Role for Museums

30. The MA's Museums Change Lives campaign¹⁹ sets out how all museums can make positive social impact in areas such as health and wellbeing, place-making, and inspiring people. It demonstrates that museums can be actively engaged with their

¹⁷ http://www.museumsassociation.org/museums-journal/news/19102016-councils-urged-to-give-museums-freedom-online

¹⁸ http://www.museumsassociation.org/museums-journal/news/19082015-york-museums-trust-calls-for-changes-to-business-rates

http://www.museumsassociation.org/museums-change-lives



communities, while also generating new income streams. It is important that museums do not lose sight of their public and social role in the drive to greater financial sustainability.

31. Recommendation: Funding agencies should regard supporting this work as a priority. ACE or HLF should use existing resources to create a Community Engagement Fund which would support museums to work in partnership with community organisations, and to explore the feasibility of increasing community investment in civic museums. It should refer to the findings of the Our Museums project by the Paul Hamlyn Foundation, which showed how community participation in museums can help foster civic engagement and participation in civil society²⁰.

Health and Wellbeing Partnerships

- 32. Partnerships between museums and health and wellbeing organisations have grown rapidly in recent years and have led to positive outcomes for patients, museums and health organisations. For example, many museums now operate programmes for people with dementia and their carers. One of the highest profile programmes is the House of Memories at National Museums Liverpool, which supports carers through a range of events and object handling sessions. It is funded by local Health Trusts and Care Commissioning Groups²¹. The National Alliance for Museums Health and Wellbeing has been set up to advance these partnerships²². The concept of 'cultural commissioning', in which public sector organisations commission museums to deliver specific health or social outcomes, is also growing in popularity.
- 33. Recommendation: Strategic funds to support partnership working across government agencies and local authorities to deliver on specific policy goals (such as the Prime Minister's Challenge on Dementia) would be an effective and targeted use of public investment. The DCMS/Department for Education Strategic Commissioning model could be replicated across other public policy priorities²³. This sort of funding is important to museums whose fixed costs can make it difficult to find space in budgets to begin this sort of work.

Place-making and Tourism

34. The contribution that museums make to 'place-making' was recognised in the government's recent White Paper on Culture. Museums are rooted locally and provide a sense of place through their activities within and outwith the museum

²⁰ http://www.phf.org.uk/programmes/our-museum/#about-the-initiative

http://www.liverpoolmuseums.org.uk/learning/projects/house-of-memories/

https://museumsandwellbeingalliance.wordpress.com/



building. Museums can play a key part in making people want to live, work, visit or invest in a place.

- 35. Recommendation: Larger civic museums should be fully represented in Local Enterprise Partnerships and culture should be fully integrated into town or regional economic plans to enable museums to play an important role in local development and place-making. This has already occurred in the New Anglia LEP, which includes a Cultural Board, allowing both business and civic leaders to take advantage of the economic impact culture can have in Norfolk and Suffolk. It also enables cultural bodies to receive funding to further boost their role in regional cultural tourism.
- 36. Recommendation: There is an opportunity to greatly increase the use of Section 106 planning requirements to support local cultural provision. The development of the Challenger Tank Plaza at the Discovery Museum in Newcastle, which brings a key exhibit into the community and provides a focal point for discussion of local military history, has been made possible because of a strategic use of the requirements in planning regulation Section 106.

Diverse Audiences

- 37. While many museums have made progress in attracting audiences from different backgrounds, museum audiences remain disproportionately white and middle class²⁴. We believe that no-one should feel that that a museum "is not for them".
- 38. Recommendation: ACE should develop an audience development fund targeting areas of low participation, building on existing work that it has supported. For example, Birmingham Museums Trust has used ACE funding to develop its Faith in Birmingham Gallery through engagement with local interfaith leaders and volunteers, responding to audience research that said museums should be safe spaces in which people can explain their differences to each other.

Diverse Workforce

- 39. The museum workforce in England is overwhelmingly white and female, according to recent research conducted jointly by the MA, ACE, AIM and MGS²⁵. In order to create the skilled workforce of the future and to engage a wider audience demographic, museums should be supported to create diverse programming and recruit a diverse workforce and Board of Trustees.
- 40. Recommendation: Apprenticeships have been under-utilised by museums.

 Additional support and targets could be a catalyst for change. DCMS or ACE could

²⁴

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/562674/Focus_on_diversity_final.pdf

http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/sites/default/files/download-file/ACE Museums Workforce ABS BOP Final Report.pdf



support a package that would encourage the uptake of apprenticeships; support practice that encourages diverse recruitment and provide in-house and crossorganisation training opportunities to foster cultural change. HLF's *Skills for the Future* programme, has had some success in providing more accessible work-based training. The programme could be developed to encourage diverse recruitment and open up entry routes into the sector. It could also be used to foster support for the current workforce with training programmes aimed at Equality, Diversity and Inclusion.

Museum Collections: Preservation, Storage and Digitisation

- 41. At present there is little understanding of the scale of museum collections in England. Estimates are based on old and incomplete data and subject to various definitional problems but there is a generally accepted estimate of no fewer than 200m items in museum collections²⁶.
- 42. Most national museums are unable to dispose of items from their collections in law, other than in exceptional circumstances. The MA's Code of Ethics sets out strict ethical guidelines for disposal from all other museum collections.
- 43. There are many circumstances where legal title to objects in museum collections is uncertain ("orphan works") or where the owner is unknown (deposited objects) or where the owner cannot be found (uncollected loans). Acquisition records in relation to these objects may be poor or non-existent. Museums may have been in possession of the objects for many years and may wish to return them to the donors or to transfer them elsewhere. However, museums have no confidence in dealing with objects if there is uncertainty over ownership.
- 44. Collections in storage have generally been underused and receive few visitors. While collections often have an important research role, many professionals within the museums sector would like to see collections used in a more proactive way that engages the public more directly. The Esmée Fairbairn Collections Fund²⁷, administered by the MA, has funded over 70 projects since 2011 that improve the use of collections and is seen as a sector-wide standard in improving collections use and engagement.
- 45. Many museum collections have grown too large for existing storage facilities. Some museums have responded by investing in high quality open storage which allows increased public access. The new open storage facility at Kelvin Hall in Glasgow is one of the best examples. Many other museums are unable to afford new storage, and many collections are already housed in poor quality facilities.
- 46. Museum collections are at risk when museums close. The recent closure of five museums in Lancashire with no plans for the future of the collections highlighted

_

²⁶ https://www.museumsassociation.org/download?id=18411

http://www.museumsassociation.org/collections/18022011-esmee-fairbairn-collections-fund



this risk. In particular, it revealed the limits of the ACE-adminstered Designaton Scheme, which supports museums holding collections deemed to be 'of national importance'.

- 47. Recommendation: A government review of the scale and state of museum collections is required. This would allow the government to make plans, in consultation with sector bodies, on the future storage and use of collections, and the desirability of disposal from non-national collections. It should consider introducing legislation to resolve the uncertain legal title of many items in museums collections. This should apply to accredited museums and galleries and confirm that they will obtain legal title to objects in their collections after a set period of years (such as 30 years). The review should also identify a responsibility for national funding to protect Designated collections.
- 48. Digitisation of collections has become increasingly common practice in museums in recent years. However, it is probably impossible to comprehensively digitise the country's museum collections, and it has not always been clear how existing digitisations projects have benefited the public in any tangible way. Engagement with online collections is generally low and digitisation has been pursued over the past two decades in a piecemeal approach, with large amounts of duplication of effort and a proliferation of platforms. Meanwhile, a substantial minority of museums still do not have satisfactory websites or digital communications with audiences and potential audiences this is a more urgent problem than that of digitisation of collections.
- 49. Recommendation: Further public support for digitisation should be subject to clear questions of public benefit. While some digitisation is undoubtedly worthwhile, the government should not support a 'comprehensive' approach, particularly not to the exclusion of other public engagement activity. Partnerships with existing platforms, such as Art UK or the British Museum's partnership with Google Cultural Institute²⁸, should be explored to increase participation with digitised collections.

Partnership Working

50. Museums of all types and sizes work in partnership with other organisations in order to meet the needs of museum audiences and users. Partnerships can exist between multiple museums, and/or can include non-museum partners such as charities, government departments or local businesses.

51. Partnerships between museums are vital for museums to deepen their impact and to ensure that collections are accessible to audiences across the UK. For example, four museums in the north of England created the Generation Partnership which used Arts Council England Strategic Touring Funding to create a series of family

http://www.museumsassociation.org/museums-journal/news/13112015-british-museum-unveils-google-partnership



friendly art exhibitions²⁹. This type of partnership reduces costs and increases a museum's social impact. Other partnerships are created to help to drive tourism and increase audience numbers. In the East Midlands, three museums worked together along with Visit England, Arts Council England and local authorities to create 'The Grand Tour' – a series of seasonal events to attract visitors to the cultural highlights of Nottinghamshire and Derbyshire³⁰. Much regional partnership working is supported by the ACE-supported Museums Development Network – a hugely important and valuable network of officers across the country who help museums to connect, work together and access funding.

- 52. For regional museums, establishing partnerships with national museums and Major Partner Museums is an important way to access their collections and expertise. For example, the British Museum's National Programme provides objects for loan to museums across the country. It also provides advice to curators on a range of curatorial issues, such as storage or pest management. These partnerships are reciprocal, and national museums benefit from the ability to work with and borrow from non-national museums.
- 53. Higher education partnerships have become more important for museums and universities in recent years. Universities are placing much greater emphasis on public engagement (including as a requirement of the Research Evaluation Framework) and on ensuring their locality is attractive to prospective students and staff. The Royal Pavilion & Museums (RPM) has a memorandum of understanding with Brighton University and has recently appointed the joint post of Keeper and Lecturer of Design History. The purpose of the role is to develop the potential of RPM's collections to support teaching, learning and research, and for collections-based scholarship to reach a wider audience through RPM. There is scope to increase this kind of partnership.
- 54. Recommendation: Partnership working between museums should continue to be supported with public funding at the national and regional levels. Partnership should be a core part of the remit of national museums, rather than an 'additional' activity that is tagged on to other work.

International Work and Soft Power

55. Museums play a central part in the UK's 'soft power' and cultural diplomacy, acting as a beacon for innovation, building cultural bridges and inspiring people to visit, work and invest in the UK. National museums continue to have the most prominent role in international work, such as international touring and cultural exchanges. However, Major Partner Museums and other regional museums also cultivate strong

 $[\]frac{^{29}}{\text{http://www.museumsassociation.org/museum-practice/new-practice/02022015-partnership-project-aimsto-engage-families-with-contemporary-art}$

http://www.thegrandtour.uk.com/about/



international partnerships with museums abroad. Many are supported by the British Council and the valuable Working Internationally Regional Project³¹.

- 56. Brexit threatens to undermine a range of important cultural networks, sources of funding, and regulatory and legislative frameworks which allow UK museums to work internationally in Europe and further afield³². However, museums can also play an important role in helping to build new links and bridges with international partners as the Brexit process continues.
- 57. Recommendation: DCMS should work with the Department for International Trade, the Foreign and Commonwealth Office, the British Council and others to promote UK museums internationally. This work should support museums seeking to work and tour internationally. It should also help museums and museum sector bodies to promote their expertise internationally it is noteworthy that the MA's Museums Change Lives campaign has been highly influential internationally and has been adopted into the cultural policies of a number of countries³³.



http://www.museumsassociation.org/download?id=1174544

http://www.museumsassociation.org/museums-change-lives